

TANZANIA

(R-PP dated 12 October 2010)

GOVERNANCE OF REDD+

*To what extent does the R-PP promote good governance within REDD+ systems and processes?***Stakeholder participation in REDD+ planning and implementation**+ *Identifies relevant stakeholders for REDD+*+ *Specifically considers how to engage vulnerable groups*+ *Establishes procedures to ensure a transparent process and accountability for stakeholder input*+ *Establishes a grievance / dispute resolution mechanism*- *Considers how to learn and build from other relevant participatory processes*

The R-PP's consultation and participation plan indicates that Tanzania has taken steps to carry out an inclusive stakeholder process, but could be more thorough in enumerating the process moving forward. A first round of consultation meetings was carried out nationwide to raise awareness about REDD and to develop a consultation and participation plan, resulting in an analysis of strengths and weaknesses for REDD (p22). These inputs were incorporated in the REDD strategic options for addressing deforestation and forest degradation. Alongside national consultations held in the initial R-PP formulation phase, the territory of Tanzania was divided into eight zones and workshops were held in each zone with participants from regional and district governments and NGOs (p21). A village was also selected from each zone, based on criteria such as forest resources and potential to undertake REDD activities, for a more local level consultation that included local communities, village leaders and extension staff. While the R-PP authors do not identify the relevant stakeholder groups in a lot of detail, they do recognize the need to do so, including 'minority or disadvantaged groups' and propose a study that will specifically consider forest dependent communities, organizations that represent them and effective mechanisms for community participation in REDD (p23). A more detailed stakeholder analysis is identified as one of the next activities needed to finalize a consultation plan (p22).

The R-PP notes the importance of incorporating principles of good governance such as transparency and accountability in the consultation process, as well as the necessity of dispute resolution, although specific procedures for ensuring these principles or creating a dispute resolution mechanism are not discussed. The authors also do not clarify the steps that will be taken for consultation and participation processes moving forward.

Recommendations:

- Propose a clearer process for conducting consultations and ensuring participation moving forward, including how stakeholder feedback will be incorporated into decision-making
- Clarify how a mechanism for resolving disputes will be established

Government coordination in REDD+ planning and implementation+ *Considers REDD+ in the context of other sector policies, land use plans, and national development plans*+ *Proposes a process to reconcile potential conflicts between REDD+ strategies and other policies/plans*+ *Proposes effective mechanisms to coordinate REDD+ across sectors*+ *Proposes effective mechanisms to coordinate REDD+ across levels of government*

The R-PP recognizes the importance of a cross-sectoral approach for REDD and states that the national REDD strategy will be closely linked to current national growth and development strategies (p40). The R-PP states that a legal and institutional review for REDD is being carried out to understand how to improve cross-sectoral coordination and policy synergies (p41). The R-PP recognizes competing interests in regards to land use, land use change and forests, and identifies other land use activities such as agricultural expansion and livestock grazing that are currently contributing to deforestation and forest degradation (Annex 2b-1, p52).

The R-PP states that Tanzania has set up a cross-sectoral National Climate Change Steering Committee (NCCSC) under which an interim National REDD Task Force and Secretariat will operate (p14). Various relevant ministries, government institutions, civil

TANZANIA

(R-PP dated 12 October 2010)

society and the private sector are represented on the NCCSC (p12). The REDD Task Force is comprised of representatives from the Forestry and Beekeeping Division, the Division of Environment and sub-national government officials, and it is recognized that its composition will need to be widened to include civil society organizations and representation from other sectors – such as agriculture. At the sub-national level, a Regional Administrative Secretariat is intended to coordinate regional REDD activities, as well as provide a link between national Ministries and district level councils. Environmental Committees originally established by the Environmental Management Act in 2004 will coordinate REDD activities at district and municipal scales (p15). The R-PP acknowledges that coordination of REDD across sectors and levels of government poses a significant challenges, and underscores the need to do needs assessments as well as build institutional capacity of the various committees and agencies tasked with REDD management and coordination (p16).

The R-PP identifies the need for conflict resolution, noting that conflicts should be addressed at the lowest possible level, typically local, and lists some existing structures that typically handle resolution of conflict such as District and Village councils (p16). Conflicts that cannot be resolved using these structures will be referred to higher levels, but the R-PP does not discuss how these existing mechanisms might need to be adapted or supported in order to address the types of issues that may be raised by REDD, or how high level cross-sectoral conflicts related to prioritization of land uses will be resolved.

Recommendation:

- Elaborate options to facilitate a multi-stakeholder process to harmonize policies across sectors

Transparent and accountable REDD+ revenue management & benefit sharing

Proposes a transparent system to track and coordinate international financing of activities related to REDD+

Considers measures to promote fiscal transparency and accountability for REDD+ revenue management

Proposes a transparent process for deciding who should benefit from REDD+ and how benefits will be targeted

Reviews lessons from past and/or existing systems for managing and distributing forest revenues

A national framework for REDD is expected to provide for the coordination of financial support from development partners for REDD activities (p20). The R-PP makes a broad commitment to developing a transparent and equitable revenue/benefit sharing mechanism and supports the development of national best practices for fiscal transparency (p44). Specific modalities have not been provided for doing so. The R-PP proposes the establishment of a national REDD Fund that would operate nationally under the National Climate Change Technical Committee (p14-15,48).

The R-PP does not significantly discuss past performance of forest revenue management and distribution in Tanzania, although it does recognize that joint forest management benefit sharing agreements between government and communities exist but are not yet operational (p32). It proposes an in-depth study on establishing and operationalizing this REDD fund that will include how to ensure transparency and accountability as well as an assessment of the performance of past systems of forest revenue management or benefit sharing schemes (p14).

The R-PP also states that local communities will be important beneficiaries, and several pilot projects are being carried out to explore REDD options including how equitable benefit distribution could be targeted to local communities (p42).

Recommendations:

- Describe how stakeholders will be consulted in designing the national REDD Fund
- Propose a mechanism for tracking management and distribution of REDD benefits
- Examine lessons learned from existing programs with benefit sharing mechanisms; an analysis of why some existing benefit sharing agreements are not yet operational may help pinpoint issues that will need to be addressed for REDD

Transparent monitoring and oversight of REDD+

Proposes to establish information management systems for REDD+ that guarantee public access to information

TANZANIA

(R-PP dated 12 October 2010)

– *Proposes mechanisms for independent oversight of the implementation of REDD+ activities*

Proposes mechanisms to monitor efforts to address governance challenges

The R-PP recognizes the need for an efficient communication and information sharing mechanism (p51) The R-PP states that a study will be carried out to understand information, communication and knowledge management needs for REDD (p41), and that a REDD networking mechanism, internet-based REDD Database and a web portal will be developed as part of the implementation framework (p51).

The R-PP proposes to develop a monitoring system that will cover carbon, social and environmental impacts, and key governance factors (p67). However, it does not indicate what types of non-carbon impacts and governance factors would be monitored, and it does not provide a clear statement on public access to information. Rather, it states that the monitoring system will “provide opportunities for participatory and transparent operation of the strategy and information sharing” without elaborating on what this might entail (p74). While the R-PP does recognize the need for independent verification of forest carbon measurements (p71), it does not propose any mechanism for independent oversight of the implementation of REDD activities.

Recommendations:

- Propose a mechanism for independent oversight of the implementation of REDD
- Elaborate on what types of governance factors will be monitored, how, and by whom

GOVERNANCE CHALLENGES FOR ADDRESSING DEFORESTATION DRIVERS

To what extent does the R-PP consider key forest governance challenges for achieving REDD+?

Land and forest tenure

Discusses the situation regarding land and forest tenure, including for indigenous peoples

Considers the capacity of judicial and non-judicial systems to resolve conflicts and uphold the rights of citizens

Links identified governance challenges to proposed REDD+ strategy options and implementation framework

While the R-PP provides a summary of the land laws of Tanzania, it does not explain the extent to which they set out clear rights to land, particularly for communities practicing communal forest management regimes. The R-PP identifies unclear land tenure, related to a lack of land-use planning, as a major problem contributing to deforestation and degradation. Tenure is also listed as a key issue under component 2c on the REDD implementation framework. While the R-PP does not go into significant detail, the implementation framework lists lack of secure land ownership as an issue to be addressed through potential actions such as harmonizing the National Land Act with the Village Land Act, registration of village land and conducting an analysis of the factors that cause insecure tenure (p50).

The R-PP discusses some existing local level institutions such as District and Village Councils and Ward Secretariats that are typically involved in maintaining rule of law and resolving conflicts, but does not discuss whether these bodies typically handle tenure conflicts that arise or their capacity to consider REDD tenure-related issues (p16).

Recommendations:

- Articulate a preliminary vision for how land, forest and carbon tenure issues will be addressed in the development of the REDD strategy and/or implementation framework
- Discuss the prevalence of land and forest resource related conflicts, and the effectiveness of judicial and non-judicial systems for resolving conflicts and upholding rights

Forest Management

Discusses the ability of forest agencies to plan and implement forest management activities

+ *Considers the role of different stakeholders, including communities, in forest management*

Links identified governance challenges to proposed REDD+ strategy options and implementation framework

TANZANIA

(R-PP dated 12 October 2010)

The R-PP provides some information on the historical and recent performance of forest agencies with respect to forest management activities (p31), which can be generally described as weak and poorly coordinated across different levels of government. In particular, the R-PP notes weak governance at the local government level, including low capacity for planning, financial management and enforcement (p29).

The R-PP does not definitively set out the roles of different stakeholders in forest management, but it does recognize the important role of communities in forest management, forest monitoring, and reducing deforestation and forest degradation, facilitated by NGOs and research institutions. The R-PP also recognizes the increasing dependency of communities on forests, the links with poverty, and the importance of livelihood-focused forest management approaches as part of incentivizing sustainable forest management and conservation under REDD (p31).

The R-PP proposes a diverse range of strategy options to address the 11 identified drivers of deforestation and forest degradation (p39). Potential strategies include addressing drivers of forest change such as overgrazing and agricultural expansion through improved land use planning and establishment of joint forest management regimes, but specific timelines or steps for taking these strategy options forward are not elaborated.

Recommendation:

- Elaborate on the specific capacity constraints of forest management agencies, local government and other involved stakeholders, and how these constraints will be overcome in order to implement REDD

Forest Law Enforcement

Discusses the ability of law enforcement bodies to effectively enforce forest laws

Discusses efforts to combat corruption in the forest sector

Links identified governance challenges to proposed REDD+ strategy options and implementation framework

The R-PP refers directly to illegal timber (p16,38), charcoal extraction (p26,29) and agricultural encroachment (p27-31) as drivers of forest change. It mentions that low capacity for law enforcement and a weak institutional framework are contributing factors. However, the R-PP does not elaborate on specific causes of weak law enforcement. Similarly, the R-PP does not mention if ongoing institutional reforms supported by the National Forest Program (Annex 2b-1) have helped to address any of these issues. Further, efforts to address law enforcement issues are only briefly mentioned within the REDD strategy as a potential activity to address 'Policy/Governance failures' by improving financial and technical capacity of law enforcement (p39). The R-PP identifies corruption as a critical issue for forest governance (p29) and articulates the need for measures to address corruption in the REDD implementation and monitoring frameworks (p44). However, the R-PP does not discuss any efforts taken to date to combat corruption in the forest sector or plans to identify ways to address these issues.

Recommendations:

- Elaborate on the challenges of forest law enforcement, and the effectiveness of recent reforms including those supported by the National Forest Program in addressing these problems
- Clarify how law enforcement challenges will be addressed in the development of the REDD strategy
- Elaborate on how corruption issues will be identified and addressed

Other Forest Governance Issues Relevant for REDD+

Discusses other forest governance issues that are relevant for REDD+

Links identified governance challenges to proposed REDD+ strategy and implementation framework

TANZANIA*(R-PP dated 12 October 2010)*

The R-PP states that the national Forest Policy is currently at the final stage of a review, and that the policy will aim to scale up programs such as Participatory Forest Management and support for improvements in governance (p28). The R-PP also states that a ten year National Forestry Program has supported reform and improvements in the governance and management of the forestry sector in Tanzania (Annex 2b-1), and that this program will be revised to accommodate REDD issues (p28). However the R-PP does not provide an assessment of the overall outcome of the Program particularly in relation to the continuing challenges for forest institutions at all levels in developing REDD. Finally, the R-PP identifies two long-term programs – the Local Government and the Public Sector Reform Programs – as being important in terms of an improved governance framework (p29). These programs aim to devolve powers to local government and improve service delivery of public institutions, and therefore could play a role in helping address governance weaknesses that will also impact the ability of institutions to implement REDD actions.

Recommendation:

- Elaborate on the key areas of inquiry for the proposed legal analysis and institutional review study